

COMMUNITY EMPOWERMENT (SCOTLAND) ACT 2015
APPLICATION FOR REVIEW UNDER SECTION 86
THORNHILL COMMUNITY CENTRE, THORNHILL ROAD, FALKIRK FK2 7AE
VOLUME 2: EVIDENCE INDEX AND PRODUCTIONS

on behalf of Falkirk Thornhill Community Hall SCIO

To be read with Volume 1: Statement of Case. 28 September 2026

How the evidence is numbered

Each document is numbered by the section of the Statement of Case in which it is first relied on, and in the order it is first relied on within that section: 04.02 is the second document first relied on in section 4. A document is numbered once, and later sections cite the same number. A number with the suffix "a" is a document closely linked to the one before it.

Documents marked "Held by the Council" are already held by Falkirk Council, including the Council's own reports, the RMWG's review volumes and correspondence to which the Council was a party or on which it was copied. In line with paragraph 13.4 of the Statement of Case, they are listed and not reproduced.

Personal data is redacted in the lodged copies, including the identities of individuals who have given statements on the basis that they are not named, contact details and bank account details. Unredacted originals are held by FTCH and can be made available to the Committee in confidence.

FTCH holds a substantial body of further evidence and will supply anything more the Committee requires as the review proceeds.

No.	Document	Relied on at paragraph	Status
Section 1. The review and what FTCH asks the Committee to do			
01.01	Council emails confirming the review deadline and submission address, August to September 2026	1.1	Produced
01.02	FTCH's asset transfer request form (validated 2 March 2026)	1.1, 1.4(b), 2.3(a), 2.3(e), 2.3(f), 4.4, 4.7, 4.10, 4.17, 4.20, 4.22, 5.2, 5.10, 6.3, 8.8, 9.2, 9.4, 10.6	Produced
01.03	Council email of 4 September 2025 confirming FTCH to hold the licence	1.4(b), 2.3(e), 5.2, 12.2, 12.10	Produced
01.04	Council email of 16 September 2025 about alternative accommodation, and FTCH reply	1.4(b), 12.2	Produced
01.05	Council licence offer letter to FTCH, 17 September 2025	1.4(b), 2.3(e), 5.2, 12.2	Produced
01.05a	Council email of 17 September 2025 enclosing Heads of Terms	1.4(b), 5.2	Produced
01.06	FTCH letter to [REDACTED], 18 September 2025	1.4(b), 4.14, 5.2	Produced
01.07	Council and FTCH emails on the licence and sub-licence, 24 to 29 September 2025	1.4(b), 2.3(e), 5.2, 7.1, 8.7, 12.2	Produced
01.08	Sub-licence, the RMWG to FTCH, dated 22 September 2025, signed	1.4(b), 2.2, 4.1, 4.15, 7.1, 7.7, 8.7, 9.1	Produced
01.09	Full Repairing and Insuring licence, Falkirk Council to the RMWG	7.1	Held by the Council
Section 3. The statutory framework			
03.01	Council report to the Executive, 20 May 2026, with appendices	2.1, 2.3(b), 2.3(h), 3.5, 4.8, 4.9, 4.13,	Held by the Council

No.	Document	Relied on at paragraph	Status
		4.14, 4.22, 5.3, 6.1, 6.2, 6.3, 8.9, 10.1, 10.4, 10.5, 12.9, 12.10	
03.02	The RMWG's application for review, volumes 1 to 3, including its asset transfer request	2.3(e), 3.3, 4.9, 5.2, 8.1, 9.1, 9.2, 10.3, 11.1	Held by the Council
Section 4. Comparative community benefit			
04.01	FTCH's Equality and Poverty Impact Assessment	2.3(a), 2.3(c), 2.3(g), 4.1, 4.2, 4.4, 4.16, 4.17, 4.19, 10.2, 11.3	Produced
04.01a	FTCH email to the Council submitting its EPIA	4.7	Produced
04.02	Community emails of support submitted with FTCH's request	4.4	Produced
04.03	FTCH's business plan (Appendix 8 to the Council's report of 20 May 2026)	2.3(f), 4.4, 4.20, 4.22, 6.2, 8.8, 9.4, 10.6	Held by the Council
04.04	Council EPIA 00471, Thornhill, January 2024	4.5	Produced
04.05	The RMWG's Council-assessed EPIA, May 2026	4.6, 4.9, 6.2, 10.1	Produced
04.06	FTCH's petition: summary and analysis	4.10, 4.11, 4.12, 4.21, 5.3, 11.1	Produced
04.07	FTCH's petition: all 23 comments, names removed	4.11	Produced
04.08	Statement from Caledonia Service, [REDACTED], September 2026	2.3(c), 4.10, 4.12, 4.16, 4.17, 4.21, 7.6, 10.3	Produced
04.09	Statement from Headway Falkirk, September 2026	2.3(c), 4.10, 4.12, 4.16, 4.17, 4.21, 10.3	Produced
04.10	Statement from the ladies' cultural heritage society, September 2026	2.3(c), 4.10, 4.12, 4.16, 4.17, 4.21, 10.3	Produced
04.11	Statement from the men's cultural heritage society, September 2026	4.10, 4.12, 4.16, 4.18, 4.21	Produced
04.12	Statement from the Sunday community bingo, September 2026	4.10, 4.12, 4.16, 4.18, 4.21	Produced
04.13	Statement from the SGI Buddhist group, Falkirk District, September 2026 (name withheld)	4.10, 4.12, 4.16, 4.18, 4.21, 6.3, 7.11	Produced
04.14	Statement from a New Scot, therapeutic theatre sessions, 20 September 2026	4.10, 4.12, 4.16, 4.19, 4.21, 11.3	Produced
04.15	Message from an instructor currently hiring from the RMWG, September 2026 (name removed)	4.10, 4.12, 4.16, 4.19, 4.21, 10.3	Produced
04.16	Message from a local resident starting a baby and toddler playgroup, September 2026 (name removed)	4.10, 4.12, 4.16, 4.19, 4.21, 10.3	Produced
04.17	Former councillor's public Facebook comment, September 2026	4.9, 4.15, 11.3	Produced
04.18	The RMWG's Facebook post inviting the Centre's groups, 26 September 2026	2.3(c), 4.9, 10.3	Produced
04.19	FTCH architect's plans and elevations, Rev B, February 2026	4.7, 4.20, 5.2	Produced
04.20	FTCH concept images of the proposed renovation	4.17, 4.20	Produced
Section 5. Collaboration and mediation			
05.01	FTCH's mediation preparation and private session with the mediator, 8 July 2026	1.4(c), 2.3(c), 2.3(e), 2.3(g), 5.2, 5.8, 10.2, 11.2	Produced

No.	Document	Relied on at paragraph	Status
05.02	FTCH's consent to the mediator and comments on the draft report, July 2026	1.4(c), 2.3(e), 5.2, 5.7, 5.8	Produced
05.03	Mediator's post-mediation report, 10 July 2026	5.2, 5.3, 5.7, 5.8	Produced
05.04	Mediator correspondence, 17 July 2026	5.7	Produced
05.05	FTCH's written submission to the Council, 11 August 2026	1.4(c), 2.3(b), 5.2, 6.4, 12.10	Produced
05.06	Council acknowledgement of FTCH's submission, August 2026	12.10	Produced
05.07	FTCH's deputation to the Executive, 13 August 2026	1.4(c), 2.3(e), 5.2	Produced
05.08	The Executive's extension decision (14 August 2026) and FTCH's acceptance (16 August 2026)	1.4(c), 2.3(e), 5.2, 5.9	Produced
05.09	Emails on the arrangements for the meeting of 26 November 2025, 11 to 18 November 2025	2.3(h), 5.4, 12.3	Produced
05.10	Emails of 20 and 21 November 2025: written submissions dropped, FTCH reply and Council reply	2.3(h), 5.4, 8.6	Held by the Council
05.11	Minutes of the meeting of 26 November 2025 and the email circulating them	2.3(g), 2.3(h), 5.5, 5.6, 7.1, 7.4, 8.6, 10.4, 11.2	Held by the Council
05.12	Council feedback emails on the applications, 18 to 20 November 2025	5.6, 9.4	Held by the Council
05.13	Emails on the MOU, recusal and Christmas deadline, December 2025 to January 2026	2.3(h), 5.6, 12.3	Produced
Section 6. The earlier assessment and scoring			
06.01	Written response of ██████████ 12 August 2026	2.3(b), 6.4, 8.6, 8.7, 12.7, 12.10	Produced
Section 7. The operating record since 1 October 2025			
07.01	The RMWG's letters of 28 October and 29/30 October 2025, and FTCH's reply of 28 October 2025	2.3(g), 8.6, 11.2, 12.7	Held by the Council
07.02	CCTV, floor and heating emails, 9 to 10 November 2025, copied to ██████████	2.3(g), 11.2	Held by the Council
07.03	Heating failure and heating key emails, December 2025	5.6, 7.1, 7.4, 7.5	Produced
07.04	Hive, protected lets and data emails, January 2026	2.3(c), 4.8, 7.4, 7.7, 7.8	Produced
07.05	Disabled toilet water ingress: FTCH report, RMWG reply and FTCH response, February 2026	7.6	Produced
07.06	Caledonia Service Tuesday let: FTCH request, RMWG refusal and Caledonia Service emails, December 2025 to February 2026	2.3(c), 4.8, 7.8	Produced
07.07	Protected let request for 28 November 2026: email thread, September 2026	2.3(c), 7.9, 8.5, 11.2, 12.6	Produced
Section 8. Governance and financial stewardship			
08.01	Invoice queries correspondence, May 2026	2.3(d), 7.3, 7.7, 7.10, 8.2	Produced
08.02	The RMWG's invoices 001 to 011 and supporting documents	2.3(d), 7.3, 8.1, 8.2, 8.3, 8.4	Held by the Council
08.03	FTCH's reconciliation of the RMWG's invoices 001 to 011, as sent to the Council on 17 September 2026	2.3(d), 8.3, 8.4, 8.9	Produced
08.04	██████████'s emails of 14 and 25 September 2026 and FTCH's letter of 17 September 2026	2.3(d), 2.3(h), 8.2, 8.3, 8.4, 8.5, 8.6, 8.7, 12.6, 12.7	Produced
08.05	FTCH's payment note and schedule to the RMWG, 18 September 2026	2.3(d), 8.2	Held by the Council
08.06	Bank confirmation of payment of £2,385.38 to the RMWG, 18 September 2026 (account details redacted)	2.3(d), 8.2	Produced
08.07	The RMWG's Operational Rules and covering email, 2 March 2026	2.3(c), 2.3(d), 4.8, 5.9, 7.4, 7.7, 7.8, 7.10, 8.1, 8.2, 8.6, 8.7, 10.4, 12.7	Produced

No.	Document	Relied on at paragraph	Status
08.08	FTCH's written rejection of the Operational Rules	8.6	Held by the Council
08.09	The RMWG's Facebook statement, September 2026 (screenshots)	2.3(d), 4.3, 7.7, 8.5	Produced
Section 12. Process, impartiality and outstanding information			
12.01	FTCH's freedom of information request, September 2026	2.3(h), 6.6, 12.1	Produced
12.02	FTCH's request to [REDACTED] for a letter of support, 26 August 2025, and her reply	2.3(h), 12.8	Produced
12.03	FTCH's contemporaneous record of the notebook found in the locked office at the Centre, 3 March 2026	12.7	Produced
12.04	Photographs of the notebook found in the locked office at the Centre, 3 March 2026 (redacted)	12.7	Produced
12.05	The RMWG's open day at the Centre, October 2025: its Facebook post and a photograph of [REDACTED] at the event	4.9, 12.8	Produced

For and on behalf of the Board of Trustees, Falkirk Thornhill Community Hall SCIO